

# Media backgrounder

For immediate release

# ICCAT's four-decade record of failure

**Rome, Italy** - This backgrounder provides an easy to follow account of the more than four decade record of the International Commission for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas (ICCAT) in protecting Atlantic bluefin tuna, the headline species and fishery in its care.

Established in the 1960s, ICCAT – setting a pattern of failing to follow its charter to manage tuna fisheries in accordance with scientific advice - presided over the collapse of western Atlantic bluefin tuna stock. Over the last two decades, warning signals that eastern Atlantic (Mediterranean) bluefin tuna are following the same trajectory have become clearer and clearer.

ICCAT's extremely belated response to the rapidly worsening state of the fishery has led to a search for alternative measures, from trade bans to market boycotts. ICCAT's own scientists and the analysis of the UN Food and Agriculture Organisation established that Atlantic bluefin tuna fitted the criteria for the highest level of trade restrictions under the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES) – but the proposal was voted down with no debate at the March 2010 meeting of parties to CITES in Doha, Qatar.

However, the most significant players on both the catch and trade sides of the bluefin tuna equation – Japan, the EU, the U.S., Norway and Canada – also committed themselves at the CITES meeting to the adoption of sustainable, science-based fisheries management measures by ICCAT.

WWF hailed these "Doha Commitments" as a major step forward and intends to hold countries to account to have them formalised at the Paris ICCAT meeting in November 2010.

**Notes:** Fisheries assessment and regulation is a complex topic, which creates challenges for any summary treatment. Stock and catch figures are often subject to revision in light of new and revised data, meaning the same figure may vary from report to report in the light of new data or improved analysis.

This backgrounder tries to make sense of and avoid a great deal of the technical language used in the reports it is drawn from. For anyone trying to correlate what is in the reports and assessments with more everyday language, the following notes might be helpful:

We use the terms *Total Allowable Catch (TAC)* and *quota* interchangeably while the documents often say *yield* in the sense of catch. Maintenance or recovery to *Maximum Sustainable Yield (MSY)* is the goal of fisheries management under the ICCAT Convention. *ICCAT's scientists* means the *ICCAT Standing Committee on Research and Statistics (SCRS)*. *Spawning Biomass (SSB)* broadly equates to spawning stock. *Recruitment* is a measure of the amount of new young individuals entering yearly to the fishery.

May 1966

ICCAT arose in a context of the growth of industrial fishing and increasing

	demand from markets implicated in the collapse of bluefin tuna populations off Brazil and in the North Sea. Similar concerns existed for the bluefin tuna of southern oceans including the southern Atlantic. Increasing signs that the tuna and tuna fisheries of the eastern (Mediterranean) and West Atlantic could go the same way led to 17 nations "desiring to cooperate in maintaining the populations of (tuna and tuna-like) fishes at levels which will permit the maximum sustainable catch for food and other purposes" signing an International Convention for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas in May 1966. The convention proposed a commission (ICCAT) which could make binding recommendations on the basis of scientific evidence, unless a majority of contracting parties objected.  ICCAT became the model for the establishment for a system of Regional
	Fisheries Management Organisations (RFMOs) to regulate international fisheries. ICCAT's shortcomings thus have a significance extending well beyond the Atlantic or its tuna populations.
March 1969	International Commission for the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas (ICCAT) formed as the principal outcome of the convention. ICCAT's boast is that "science underpins the management decisions made by ICCAT". The new body's immediate priority was seen as preventing the collapse of the dwindling western Atlantic bluefin tuna population and its fishery.
1981 to date	ICCAT consistently sets catch quotas for western Atlantic bluefin tuna above levels recommended by its scientists, who from 1982 are recommending western catches "be reduced to as near zero as possible". Quotas began that year at just 1,160 tonnes, went to 2,660 tonnes the next year, dropped for a few years from 1991 in response to a threatened Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES) listing, and nudged their way up to 2,700 tonnes by 2004. Catches, however, began to crash below quota from 2003 with a low point of just 29 per cent of quota in 2006. The quota is now – slowly – following the catch down with a current scientific recommendation that it needs to be reduced further still.
1994	With reported catch levels rising 27 per cent between 1993 and 1994, ICCAT recommends to members that they reduce eastern Atlantic and Mediterranean tuna catches by 25 per cent from current levels in the period 1996-8. Subsequent analysis shows catches rose by up to 8.4 per cent.
1996	First tuna farm facilities established in the Mediterranean in Croatia and Spain.  Red-listing of Atlantic bluefin tuna by the International Union for the Conservation of Nature, with the western Atlantic stock listed as critically endangered and the eastern Atlantic and Mediterranean bluefin listed as endangered.  With declared annual bluefin catches in the order of 43,000 tonnes, ICCAT's scientific body, the Standing Committee on Research and Statistics (SCRS) recommends an annual catch of 25,000 tonnes.
1998	The SCRS maintains the 25,000-tonne recommendation noting it will "halt the decline in spawning biomass" but could not be expected to return it to historical levels. ICCAT recommends a 1999 TAC of 32,000 tonnes and 29,500 tonnes for 2000.
2002	ICCAT sets the Total Allowable Catch (TAC, quota) for East Atlantic and Mediterranean bluefin tuna at 32,000 tonnes for the period 2003-2006. In its 2006 assessment, the SCRS notes reported catches were below quota in 2003 and 2004 but substantially higher in 2005 – but it believed actual catches were in the order of 50,000 tonnes throughout the period and that "it is apparent that the TAC was not respected and was largely ineffective in controlling overall catch".

	WWF report Tuna farming in the Mediterranean: the 'coup de grâce' to a
	dwindling population? warns that the growth of poorly regulated tuna fattening farms is adding substantial pressure to the already declining and overfished bluefin population. The report's predictions are to be fully validated – just over a decade from the establishment of the first farm, there are nearly 70 farms throughout the Mediterranean with a capacity of about 60,000 tonnes (more than twice the then fishing quotas) and an expanded fishing capacity to supply them.
June 2004	WWF report <i>Tuna farming in the Mediterranean</i> highlights the perverse impact of generous EU subsidies for aquaculture flowing to tuna fattening farms relying totally on wild stock. The report also links the growth of tuna farming, now taking almost all the purse seine catch, to the declining quality of catch statistics.
July 2006	WWF report <i>The plunder of bluefin tuna in the Mediterranean and East Atlantic in 2004 and 2005</i> shows that illegal, unregulated and unreported tuna fishing is rampant in the Mediterranean, with actual catch about 40 per cent higher than declared catch. The report, by industry experts Advanced Tuna Ranching Technologies (ATRT S.L.), reveals deliberate misreporting and laundering of bluefin tuna catches, with unreported catches increasingly processed at sea for shipment to Japan.
August 2006	ICCAT's scientists make their toughest recommendation yet, saying that "the only scenarios which have potential to address the declines and initiate recovery are those which (in combination) close the Mediterranean to fishing during spawning season and decrease mortality on small fish through fully enforced increases in minimum size. Realized catches in the next few years implied by fully implementing these actions are expected to be in the order of 15,000 tonnes."
November 2006	ICCAT votes to accept an EU proposal for a quota of 29,500 tonnes, reducing to 25,500 tonnes by 2010. This proposal, billed as a recovery plan for bluefin, includes new restrictions on fish sizes and bans spotter planes. WWF brands the proposal a "collapse plan", an assessment later echoed by independent scientists. Evaluating the effect of this "recovery" scheme in 2009, ICCAT's scientists concluded that Atlantic bluefin stocks had a less than 50 per cent chance of recovery by 2023 under most scenarios considered. Collapse of the population was the outcome under a substantial number of the scenarios.
October 2007	WWF report states that EU Common Fisheries Policy is failing to achieve the sustainable management of European fish stocks, including bluefin.
April 2008	WWF report Race for the last bluefin shows the bluefin tuna purse seine fleet alone had a capacity almost twice quota levels and more than three and a half times scientifically recommended catch levels. Some 25 new vessels were under construction at the time of publication. EU fisheries commissioner Joe Borg subsequently called on member states to ensure "the necessary scrapping of vessels till a sustainable balance is found between fishing capacity and fishing possibilities".
June 2008	European Commission closes the fishery to industrial boats from EU member states 15 days before the official end of season, as reported catches passed the quota – but as Commissioner Borg noted in announcing the closure, "at this moment in time, half the French fleet has caught nothing according to official figures, while the other half declare that they have caught over 90 per cent of their individual quotas, although all the vessels show similar activity rates." Italy, where Borg referred to vessels being between 100 and 240 per cent over-quota already, commences legal action against the Commission, claiming it had been prevented from fishing its full quota. Fishing vessels from other non-EU Mediterranean countries immediately move in to fishing grounds vacated by European vessels.

### September 2008

ICCAT's scientific committee meets to establish recommendations for the forthcoming special meeting, estimating that the bluefin catch in 2007 was 61,000 tonnes, twice the current total allowable catch (TAC), and four times the sustainable fishing level. The SCRS recommends management strategies involving a quota range of between 8,500 tonnes and 15,000 tonnes, noting that continuing with "the current management scheme will most probably lead to further reduction in spawning stock biomass with high risk of fisheries and stock collapse".

ICCAT independent performance review deems management of the East Atlantic and Mediterranean bluefin fishery to be an "international disgrace" with "indications that collapse could be a real possibility". The report recommends ICCAT immediately suspend fishing until its members show they "can control and report on their catch". Additional recommended measures include closure of spawning grounds in spawning periods. Noting illegal fishing pushing to twice quota levels and four times scientific recommendations the report concludes "It is difficult to describe this as responsible fisheries management."

# October 2008

WWF report *Lifting the lid on Italy's bluefin tuna fishery* exposes flagrant violations of ICCAT and EC regulations by Italy's purse seine fleet, finding overfishing in 2007 of more than five times reported levels and making a nonsense of Italy's claim to be under quota in 2008. Documented offences included continued illegal use of spotter planes, an abundance of unregistered and unlicensed vessels, and unrecorded diversions of catch to tuna farms in Croatia, Malta and Tunisia.

Majority of government representatives attending the World Conservation Congress – including key fishing nation Spain and key market Japan – support a resolution proposed by WWF, among others, to suspend the fishery until it can be brought under control, establish protected areas in main spawning areas, close the fishery during the May-June-July spawning period and maintain catch quotas in line with scientific advice.

European Commission adopts what it describes as a strong negotiating mandate for the forthcoming ICCAT meeting, which includes "taking into account scientific advice, balancing capacity of fishing fleets and tuna farms with the availability of the resource, revising technical measures such as shortening the fishing season ... and pushing for a stronger control system for the whole fishery". Then President of the EU Fisheries Council, French Fisheries Minister Michel Barnier, says the negotiating mandate did not exclude the moratorium scenario.

#### November 2008

Italian fishers associations Federpesca and Federcoopesca endorse a fishing moratorium as "the lesser of all evils".

Spain's parliament calls on government to take the lead in establishing bluefin tuna sanctuaries in the three most important spawning grounds.

After repeated requests from the European Parliament, the European Commission produces a summary of results of a still hidden report on the outcomes of increased industry surveillance and inspections by its Community Fisheries Control Agency (CFCA). The summary notes that extensive consultations with fishers and improved control measures had little effect on the low priority industry gave to ICCAT rules. Says the report: "the level of apparent infringements detected in the tugs and the purse seiner fleet is considerable", "the (illegal) use of spotter planes for searching bluefin tuna concentrations is still wide spread" and "as regards the recording and reporting of bluefin tuna catches ... the ICCAT rules have not been generally respected". The revelations undermine claims that increased controls could lead to increased industry compliance as an alternative to catch restrictions or fishery suspension.

	Questions are also raised as to why this key compliance information was not made available to ICCAT science and compliance committees prior to the November meeting.
	World's largest bluefin trader, Japan's Mitsubishi Corporation (MC), says it "will reassess our involvement in this business" if it cannot be made sustainable. "Specifically, MC supports lower quotas, shorter seasons, increases in the minimum size of tuna that can be fished, and the protection of tuna spawning grounds as well as a full moratorium if the scientific data and recommendations presented by SCRS indicate that such is required for the recovery of the fishery, and if implemented as an international rule that is fair, effective and enforceable," the statement said.
17 Nov 2008	Opening of ICCAT's 16 <sup>th</sup> special meeting in Marrakech, Morocco, charged with reviewing the management of the bluefin tuna fisheries. Earlier ICCAT Chair Fabio Hazin had written to members warning that the meeting was "our very last chance to prove that we can do our job properly. If we fail, other institutions will take over."
24 Nov 2008	ICCAT casts aside the views of its scientists and the review panel to endorse a revised "recovery plan" with a 2009 TAC of 22,000 tonnes and a "bad weather" tweak to the closed season which would inevitably allow additional industrial fishing during the spawning season. The fishing moratorium suggested by ICCAT's review and others including WWF was not even placed on the meeting agenda. The EU drove the decision — supported by Algeria, Egypt, Morocco, Syria and Tunisia and later joined by Japan — giving little ground from an initial proposal for a TAC of 25,500 tonnes. Japan had initially been party to a Brazil, Canada, Iceland, Mexico, Norway and US proposal, supported by a brace of developing nations, to fix the allowed catch at the 15,000-tonne upper levels recommended by scientists and closing the fishery for the full spawning period of May, June and July. The debate was marred by allegations of trade-related bullying by the EU, with the names of smaller developing nations appearing and disappearing from proposals more in line with the scientific recommendations. WWF, saying ICCAT had come up with "a disgrace, not a decision", announced it would be exploring other options such as CITES listing for Atlantic bluefin.  The 2009 review by ICCAT's scientists could say nothing better about the measure than that it was "a step in the right direction" which was "unlikely to fully fulfil the objective of the plan to rebuild the stock to the Maximum Sustainable Yield level by 2023".
March 2009	Monaco becomes the first country in the world to be bluefin tuna free, with all restaurants and retailers in the Principality, including Carrefour, stopping serving and selling the endangered species – joining a growing list of restaurants and major retailers taking Mediterranean bluefin off menus and shelves worldwide.  The End of the Line, a book then documentary by acclaimed British journalist Charles Clover, highlights the plight of bluefin tuna and the global mismanagement of regional fisheries management organizations established
A!! 0000	largely on the ICCAT model.
April 2009	WWF releases new analysis based on ICCAT statistics showing that if fisheries management is not improved, the reproducing stocks of Atlantic bluefin tuna could collapse as soon as 2012.
October 2009	Principality of Monaco lodges formal proposal for Atlantic bluefin tuna to be listed under Appendix I of CITES convention. Some 21 of the 27 EU member states voted to co-sponsor the proposal – missing were the six Mediterranean fishing nations of Cyprus, France, Greece, Italy, Malta and Spain. French president Nicholas Sarkozy however had earlier indicated support for the CITES-based

trade ban, saying he intended to seek a basis of respect for scientific advice in the reform of Europe's fisheries policy. "One of the first applications of this will be France's support for the inclusion of bluefin tuna in the international convention on wildlife appendix to prohibit trade in this species."

ICCAT's scientists conducting a stock assessment for the ICCAT meeting scheduled for Recife, Brazil in November conclude that the estimated Mediterranean and East Atlantic bluefin tuna catch for 2008 – not including any illegal fishing by unregistered boats – was 34,120 tonnes, well over quota. "Even in the most optimistic evaluation ... assuming recruitment will not decrease if Spawning Stock Biomass continues to decline, substantial overfishing was occurring and spawning biomass was well below levels needed to sustain Maximum Sustainable Yield." In the absence of a full review of fishing data, the scientists repeated their 2008 advice that quotas should be as low as a quarter of this catch. They again suggest a key role for time/area closures of the fishery to aid recovery.

In an extraordinary extension meeting, the scientists consider whether Atlantic bluefin tuna meets the criteria (population less than 15 per cent of historical baseline) for the highest level of trade restrictions (CITES Appendix 1 listing). For multiple runs using a variety of assumptions, they conclude the overall probability that Atlantic bluefin tuna meets the criteria is virtually 100 per cent.

Modelling future projections for Atlantic bluefin tuna under a variety of different management regimes found that the only management plan with a greater than 50 per cent chance of ensuring that Atlantic bluefin tuna no longer qualified for CITES Appendix I by 2019 was a complete suspension of the fishery.

The plight of the Mediterranean bluefin makes the cover of TIME magazine and other top global media as the scrutiny of ICCAT continues to mount worldwide.

### November 2009

US president Barack Obama's office pens a letter to ICCAT members noting that "over the past 40 years, ICCAT has overseen a 72 per cent decline in the adult population of the eastern Atlantic and Mediterranean stock of bluefin tuna". "As a member of ICCAT, the United States calls for strong and definitive action at the November 2009 meeting in Brazil," the letter said. "This includes ending overfishing by establishing management measures that set responsible science based management measures that set responsible science-based quotas, strongly enforce these quotas and closures during spawning periods, and address illegal, unrecorded and unreported fishing."

ICCAT chair Dr Fabio Hazin opened its meeting near Recife, Brazil on a sombre tone, noting yet again that "there will be no future for ICCAT if we do not fully respect and abide by the scientific advice". He went on to draw more attention to the illegal fishing issue, calling for ICCAT to set up "an efficient mechanism for the monitoring and control of the fishing fleets" and capable of "applying penalties proportional to the infringements detected". "We have been very much able to impose sanctions on non-members in the past and time has also come for ICCAT to show it does not have double standards, and that it is equally determined to also impose sanctions on its members in the same way it does with non-members," Hazin said.

With a key study presented to the meeting showing that even a strictly enforced 8,000-tonne quota would have only a 50 per cent chance of achieving a recovery in eastern Atlantic bluefin tuna, ICCAT dropped its 2010 quota from 19,500 tonnes to 13,500 tonnes. A new provision allowed for a 2011 fishery closure if the fishery was detected as being at serious danger of collapse – a measure difficult to reconcile with scientific committee data showing stocks already down to 10-15 percent of unfished levels. The purse seining

season in the Mediterranean was reduced from two months to one – but still included the peak spawning period. ICCAT also continued to ignore the long-standing calls to establish sanctuaries in key bluefin spawning grounds such as Spain's Balearic Islands.

WWF said the outcome was "entirely unscientific and entirely unaccentable" and

WWF said the outcome was "entirely unscientific and entirely unacceptable" and heightened the need for an international trade ban until stocks recovered and effective fisheries management measures were put in place.

On a more positive note, the "bad weather" extension to the fishing season was cancelled, a schedule for more significant reductions in fishing capacity was announced and ICCAT committed to following a 2011-13 recovery plan "on a basis of the (scientific) advice", which had a 60 per cent chance of achieving sustainable fish stocks by 2022.

## December 2009

Europe poured €34.5 million of EU taxpayers' money into increasing and modernizing its oversize bluefin tuna fleets over the very period it was coming to concede that excess fishing capacity was a key factor in overfishing and illegal fishing of collapsing bluefin stocks, according to an answer to a European Parliament question asked in September. Of that, €23 million was for new vessels and €10.5 million was pumped into renovating existing vessels. Only €I million went into decommissioning boats, all smaller artisanal vessels. The figure substantially underestimates real fleet subsidies, as it doesn't take into account additional amounts paid to their fleets by EU member states.

A UN Food and Agriculture Organisation expert panel, charged by CITES with producing a technical assessment of proposals for the listing of commercially traded marine species, notes that "a majority of the panel agreed that the available evidence supports the proposal listing under CITES Appendix I of Atlantic bluefin tuna". "... An Appendix I listing would be likely to reduce the bluefin catches from both component populations," the statement concluded. "This would assist to ensure that recent unsustainable catches in the east Atlantic and Mediterranean are reduced."

#### February 2010

Compliance with the ICCAT catch documentation scheme was just 43 per cent in 2009, an ICCAT compliance meeting in Madrid was told. Of the 19,844 tonnes of bluefin tuna reported by ICCAT contracting parties as having been fished in 2009, only 8,614 tonnes had been included in the catch documentation fleets are obliged to transmit to the ICCAT secretariat within 5 days of the validation of every fishing operation. The meeting was also told that Japan would withhold 2200 tonnes of presumed "illegal" frozen tuna from market and that more than 800 tonnes of undocumented bluefin had been released to the wild from Tunisian and Maltese fattening farms.

#### March 2010

Despite growing political support and watertight scientific justification, the proposal to list Atlantic bluefin tuna on CITES Appendix I is voted down as a result of strong political pressure – especially from Japan.

However, the "Doha Commitments" from Japan, the EU, the U.S., Canada and Norway – as well as the ICCAT Chairman – pledge these players will lead in pushing for ICCAT to adopt science-based measures for the fishery when they next meet in November 2010 in Paris.

"This CITES meeting should be a turning point on the road to recovery for Atlantic bluefin tuna, especially given that the biggest bluefin tuna fishing nations on both sides of the Atlantic – the U.S. and EU – were supportive of the trade ban. They stood ready to sacrifice short-term gain for the long-term survival of a species and a fishing tradition. These concerns must be translated into scientifically based management measures at ICCAT," said Dr Sergi Tudela, WWF's head of fisheries for the Mediterranean.

## June 2010

The huge overcapacity of bluefin industrial fleets is graphically demonstrated

	when Europe's bloated fleet is called back into port after doing a month's fishing in only a few days time.  In a statement following an informal meeting of some ICCAT members in Barcelona, Spain, key players in the fishery confirm their renewed commitment to follow scientific advice in deciding new recovery and management measures for the fishery – but the EU is surprisingly absent from the declaration.
8 October 2010	ICCAT's scientific committee laments that the "data limitations that have plagued previous assessments remain" and recommend that greater precaution be applied to setting quotas. To achieve an "at least" 60 per cent probability of recovering Mediterranean bluefin tuna stocks by 2022, scientist recommend a catch quota "between zero and the current 13,500 tonnes" – WWF believes the aspiration should be well into the lower half of this band.
26 October 2010	EU fishing Member States continue to give indications they may seek to swim away from both the Doha Commitments and obligations under the EU Common Fisheries Policy and the EU Marine Strategy Framework Directive, refusing fishing cuts as part of any recovery plan for bluefin tuna at a meeting of the European Fisheries Council.
6 November 2010	An eight-month investigation by the International Consortium of Investigative Journalists (ICIJ) documents a black market in east Atlantic bluefin tuna worth an estimated \$US 4 billion between 1998 and 2007. The inquiry, which had to deal with "a wall of secrecy" noted government involvement in falsifying catch and farming data and said data from ICCAT's Bluefin Tuna Catch Documentation scheme "is full of holes, rendering the data almost useless".
9 November 2010	WWF and Greenpeace analysis of 2010 catch data provided to ICCAT parties shows widespread rule violation continues, despite new observer rules. Catches and transfers went undocumented; duplicate, misleading and contradictory documentation was common; and the great majority of ICCAT observers said they were forced to rely on estimates provided by company skippers and divers.
17 November 2010	ICCAT annual meeting commences in Paris, continuing to 27 November. WWF is recommending catch quotas be more than halved to between zero and 6,000 tonnes annually, that industrial purse seine fishing be suspended – allowing only a moderate artisanal catch – and that no fishing be allowed in the six known Mediterranean spawning areas during the spawning season. WWF is also urging enforcement of payback rules that provide for past overfishing to be repaid with cuts in future quotas.

This backgrounder on ICCAT will be kept updated and can be found on <a href="www.panda.org/tuna">www.panda.org/tuna</a> or <a href="www.panda.org/media">www.panda.org/media</a>. Other information products and current news on bluefin tuna, including Frequently Asked Questions, are available at the same locations. For media resources related to the CITES meeting, visit <a href="www.panda.org/cites/media">www.panda.org/cites/media</a>.

WWF reports cited in this chronology can be found on the publications page at www.panda.org/tuna

#### **Further questions:**

Gemma Parkes, WWF Mediterranean // +39 346 387 3237 // gparkes@wwf.panda.org

www.panda.org/media for latest news and media resources

## **About WWF**

WWF is one of the world's largest and most respected independent conservation organizations, with almost 5 million supporters and a global network active in over 100 countries. WWF's mission is to stop the degradation of the earth's natural environment and to build a future in which humans live in harmony with nature, by conserving the world's biological diversity, ensuring that the use of renewable natural resources is sustainable, and promoting the reduction of pollution and wasteful consumption.